

Challenges and Lessons in Social Protection in small LA countries: reaching the poor through CCT programmes

Fabio Veras Soares
International Poverty Centre

Origins of CCT in LA countries

- They started in high middle income countries - Mexico: Progresa (1997) and Brasil: Bolsa Escola (1995)
- Experiences in poorer/smaller countries: Honduras (PRAF II) and Nicaragua (RPS). Supply issues are dealt with.
- Chile Solidario: psycho-social support and preferential access to public programmes.

Expansion in LA countries

- Now it is in many LA countries such as:

Colombia (2001): Familias en Accion

Ecuador (1998 and 2003): Bono de desarrollo humano

Dominican Republic (2005): Programa Solidariedad

Panama (2005-6): Red de Oportunidades

Paraguay (2005): Tekopora (well-being in Guarani)

El Salvador (2005): Red Solidaria

Peru (2006): Juntos

Argentina (2002) : Jefes de Hogares

Jamaica (2001): PATH - Programme of Advancement
through Health and Education

CCTs in LA

- Programmes have different origins, based on different diagnostics and social protection systems.
- They do have common elements: cash transfers and conditionalities
- However there are other features that are very different: design, targeting strategy, amount transferred, synergies with supply side.
- Programmes (countries) tend to influence each other, but the influence of the pioneers and of the cooperation agencies is much stronger in the small countries.
Second generation: Mexico and Third generation: Chile.

The objectives of the CCTs: design challenge

- The double objective of the programmes: to reduce the (extreme) poverty in the short-run and to break the intergenerational cycle of poverty through investments in human capital

Which is the most important objective? Aren't there some contradictions between the two objectives?

- 1) Income insurance (*Bolsa Familia*)
- 2) Human capital accumulation
- 3) “Developmental approach”: micro-credit and training

Based on the objectives of the programmes: one has to define the target population and the total number of beneficiaries?

Targeting: permanent challenge

- Why targeting? How to target?
- Concept poverty and the objectives of the programme: monetary concept *versus* unsatisfied basic needs *versus* efficient targeting (HC).
- Geographical targeting: poverty mapping
- Categorical/demographic targeting
- Selection of beneficiaries: means testing, *proxy* means testing, multidimensional index (does the method matter?)
- Static and dynamic approach: the inclusion of new beneficiaries and graduation rules.
- Community targeting: advantages and problems

From conditionalities towards co-responsibilities: just a change of word?

- Are conditionalities needed?
 - Change incentives and cultural aspects
 - Gain political support
 - Evaluation results (low income-elasticity of school attendance)
- Supply issues and the concept of corresponsibility: effective access to basic rights: health and education
- Conditionalities and poverty diagnostic: from human capital towards the sustainability of the beneficiary families.
- Which conditionalities are important?
- Monitoring of conditionalities *versus* monitoring of co-responsibilities.
 - Costs and implementation difficulties

Exit doors or graduation: when and how?

- Does it make sense to talk about exit doors if the focus is in HC accumulation?
 - Duration of the programme for beneficiary families
 - Eligibility reassessment (every 2 to 3 years).
- Beyond human capital: the adoption of the family support and complementary programmes
 - Are complementary programmes adapted to beneficiary families?
 - Aren't costs too high? Have those programmes being evaluated? Are they cost-effective?

Institutional issues: the local level

- Coordination among different government levels: political use of the programme and institutional jealousy.
- Ownership at the local level: budget, infrastructure, participation in the implementation.
- Bottlenecks at the local level:
 - no social protection experience at the local level
 - reaching the poor: ¿another reason for the family support?
 - community participation and social control at the local level

Institutional issues: coordination with line ministries

Best practices:

- Line ministries should be involved from the design to evaluation.
- Budget to tackle supply side problems (face the increase in demand)

Problems:

- monitoring of conditionalities and corresponsibilities; bargain over the budget; institutional jealousy; difficulty to bring on board public servants from other ministries (teachers, nurses and doctors)
- The components linked to “productive activities” such as microcredit and training.
- **More institutions are involved more coordination required.**

Limits and opportunities

The future of CCTs in small countries:

- Sustainable? What does sustainable mean: exit doors or budget restrictions?
- How to overcome supply side bottlenecks and institutional constraints.
- - How to articulate CCTs with social protection in general?
- Are CCTs part of a social protection system or are they emergency programmes to save one generation or an emergency safety net?

What about the African context?

- Kalomo experiment: non-viable households and unconditional
- OVC in Kenya: conditional
- Budget constraint and use of ODA.
- Starting point of a social protection system: CCT *versus* pensions
- To condition or not?
- How to target? How to select beneficiaries?
- How to build new institutions?
- The importance of national ownership

A successful beneficiary family??!!



BOLETIN DE CALIFICACIONES 2º CICLO

Institución: Colegio Nacional San Carlos
 Localidad: Unión Departamento: San Pedro

NOMBRE (S) Y APELLIDO(S): Gualberto Salvador Cosco Franco
 GRADO: Octavo EDAD: AÑO: 2005

ETAPAS	Periodo Ordinario					Examen Comple- mentario	Examen de Regulariza- ción
	Primera Etapa	Segunda Etapa	Tercera Etapa	Calif. Final			
	Nº Letras	Nº Letras	Nº Letras	Nº Letras	Nº Letras	Nº Letras	Nº Letras
LENGUA Y LITERATURA CASTELLANA	2 Dos	3 Tres	3 Tres	2 Dos	3 Tres		
LENGUA Y LITERATURA GUARANÍ	4 Cuatro	4 Cuatro	4 Cuatro	2 Dos	3 Tres		
EDUCACIÓN ARTÍSTICA	3 Tres	4 Uno	2 Dos	3 Tres	3 Tres		
MATEMÁTICA	3 Dos	4 Uno	1 Uno	2 Dos	2 Dos		
Historia y Geografía	2 Dos	2 Dos	2 Dos	1 Uno	1 Uno		
Formación Ética y Cívica	5 Cinco	5 Cinco	5 Cinco	5 Cinco	5 Cinco		



<http://www.undp-povertycentre.org/cct>

- Thank you!
- Muchas Gracias!
- Obrigado!

